

**The Vocation of Business:
The Theory and Practice of Social Justice
Annotated Table of Contents**

Part I: The Historical Background 1

The first part of the book introduces the major themes and discusses the historical background. Without understanding the history of any question that touches on human welfare, it is impossible to fully understand the question and hence impossible to arrive at sane answers.

Chapter 1: Justice and Economics 1

Does the Church actually have a right to comment on economic matters? Does she have any competence? Answering these questions requires us to establish a connection between justice and economics. This, in turn, requires us to delve into the final cause of all economic activity, which is desire (eros). The key question is the relationship between eros and virtue.

<i>Catholic Social Teaching and the Businessperson</i>	1
<i>Why a "Social Teaching"?</i>	3
<i>Justice and Economics</i>	5
<i>The Erotic Economy</i>	7
The Structure of Desire.....	8
<i>Business as a School of Virtue</i>	9
<i>The Vocation of Business</i>	11

Chapter 2: The Modern Moral Dialogue 12

If economics is rooted in justice, we are immediately presented with a problem, since "justice" is a moral term. However, in a pluralistic society, is a moral dialogue really possible? In an age of individualism, can there be a "common good" that is more than just a summation of individual desires? In this chapter, I argue that modern moral discourse is rooted in notions received from the Enlightenment, notions that fragment and isolate man in a sterile individualism and leads to a moral autism. Recovering an authentic moral dialogue requires that we see the individual as a "person," a being in relationship with others. The moral dialogue is always a cultural discourse embedded in narratives and practices that are dependent on some notion of the ultimate purpose and nature of man.

<i>Is a Moral Dialogue Possible?</i>	12
<i>The Fragmentation of Moral Discourse</i>	14
Immanuel Kant	15
David Hume	16
No "Ought" from "Is"?	16
Utilitarianism	16
Emotivism	18
<i>Recovering the Moral Dialogue</i>	19
Moral Logic	19
The Individual and Society.....	20
The Person as a Functional Term.....	22

Values and Culture.....	23
<i>Culture, Narrative, and Practice</i>	24
Competing Narratives.....	25
Narrative and Rationality	26
Narrative and Practice	27
<i>The Culture of the Firm</i>	28
<i>Conclusion</i>	30
Chapter 3: Justice in Economic History	31
<i>Pre-capitalist economics relied on a unity of distributive and corrective justice that united the personal and social aspects of man. With the rise of capitalism, purely individualistic notions of economics began to dominate, and the unity of corrective and distributive justice was shattered. Economics was bifurcated into two opposed traditions, the labor theorists who emphasized distributive justice and the utilitarians who emphasized corrective justice. Neither could form a complete economic theory.</i>	
<i>The Recent History of Economic History</i>	31
<i>The Preacher as Economist</i>	32
Aristotle.....	32
Distributive and Corrective Justice.....	33
Natural and Unnatural Exchange.....	34
St. Thomas Aquinas and the Scholastics	35
Just Price Theory	36
<i>The Economist as Preacher</i>	37
Adam Smith.....	38
The Labor Theory of Value	39
The “Invisible Hand”	41
The Fragmentation of Economics.....	42
David Ricardo.....	43
The Law of Rents.....	44
The Labor Theory of Value	45
Karl Marx	46
<i>The Utilitarians</i>	48
Thomas Malthus.....	48
Jean Baptiste Say.....	50
Nassau Senior	51
Gluts.....	51
Methodology.....	52
Distribution of Incomes.....	52
The New Poor Law of 1834	53
<i>Summary</i>	54
Chapter 4: The Disappearance of Justice	55
<i>The marginalist revolution provided economists with a tool that was believed to dictate the distributions of all income and property by a “natural law” that operated totally within the bounds of corrective justice. This allowed distributive justice to be “swallowed up” by corrective justice. However, the system was increasingly unstable and prone to inequalities and depressions. Keynes re-introduces the question of distributive justice, but in a peculiar way; it becomes a question not so much of economics as of politics. The economic system will produce the wealth and the political system will</i>	

tax and redistribute it. Distributive justice becomes, therefore, re-distributive. Distributive justice is banished to the political realm and ceases to be an economic factor. This banishment of justice is dogmatized in the “positive” economics of the Chicago School.

The Marginalist Revolution..... 55
 Marginal Utility 55
 Marginal Utility in Exchanges 55
 General Equilibrium 56
 Distribution of Incomes 57
 Neoclassicism 58
 Individualism 59
 Natural Law 60
 Equity and Equilibrium 61

The Keynesian Revolution..... 62
 A World in Turmoil 62
 The Failure of Equilibrium..... 63
 The Psychology of Markets 64
 The Business Cycle 65
 Equity and Equilibrium 67
 The Impact of Keynes..... 69

Utility Triumphant 70
 Chicago and Austria 70
 Sex, Marriage, and Utility 72

The Disappearance of Justice 73

Chapter 5: Property, Culture and Economics..... 76

Economics deals with social relationships and the most fundamental social relationships are property relations. Property is the foundation of all wealth, and the rules for the distribution of property will dictate economic outcomes. These rules vary greatly from culture to culture, leading to a variety of economic systems. In this chapter, four different property systems are analyzed from the standpoint of the Thomistic distinction between ownership and use of property. All property systems arise from a culture's notions of justice, and these notions, along with the property systems that arise from them, will be crucial in determining the shape of the economy and all income distributions.

Property as the Foundation of Wealth..... 76
 Ownership and Use 77

Property and Culture 78
 Sabbath Land..... 78
 Aristotle’s Athens 81
 The Middle Ages 82
 The Modern Era..... 87

Property and Economics..... 90
 Economic Rent 90
 The Mystification of Property 91

A Question of Values..... 92

Part II: The Social Encyclicals.....94

The second part of this book presents certain major social teachings of the Catholic Church. The encyclicals are presented in their own terms, with as little editorial comment as possible. The reader is

asked to understand each encyclical in its own terms, laying aside for a time their own cultural and ideological baggage.

Chapter 6: *Rerum Novarum*: A Scandalous Encyclical? 94

At a time when the marginalist revolution was claiming to reduce economics to a "science," the Pontiff was enunciating a purely moral requirement, the just wage, which he did not bother to relate to the new economic science, or indeed to any science, old or new. Was the Pope interfering in matters beyond his authority, or was he pointing out something the economists had missed?

<i>Reading the Social Encyclicals</i>	94
<i>The Historical Background</i>	94
The Catholic Response	96
<i>Reading the Encyclical</i>	96
Socialism and Property (7-17)	97
Family (18-23)	97
The Role of the Church (24-25)	97
The Duties of Rich and Poor (26-32)	98
The Proper Use of Wealth (33-39).....	98
Duties of the State (45-60).....	98
The Just Wage (61-66).....	98
Associations (68-80).....	99
<i>The Strategy of Rerum Novarum</i>	99
<i>The Scandal of Rerum Novarum</i>	99

Chapter 7: *Laborem Exercens*: Work as the Key to the Social Question 102

The "Polish Pope" came from a working class background, and he places the worker at the center of the economic question. Work is examined in its totality: its economic, social, and spiritual aspects. This shifts the locus of the whole debate.

<i>The Polish Pope</i>	102
<i>Reading Laborem Exercens</i>	102
Work as the key to the social question.....	102
Work and Man	102
The Priority of Labor over Capital	103
The Conflict between Capital and Labor	103
The Rights of Workers	105
Elements for a Spirituality of Work	105
<i>A Practical Spirituality of Work</i>	105
Work as Transitive and Intransitive	106
The Priority of Labor over Capital	106
The Direct and Indirect Employers.....	107
The Spirituality of Work.....	107

Chapter 8: *Centesimus Annus*: The Uncertain Victory 108

This encyclical was written as the Soviet empire was falling apart. The central question is, "Which way forward?" With the defeat of communism, the West can and should turn to the shortcomings in its own system, shortcomings which center around an "economistic" view of man.

<i>The Defeat of Communism</i>	108
--------------------------------------	-----

<i>Reading Centesimus Annus</i>	108
Characteristics of Rerum Novarum	108
Towards the New Things of Today	109
The Year 1989.	110
Private Property and the Universal Destination of Goods.	111
State and Culture.	113
The Person is the Way of the Church.....	114
<i>An Endorsement of Capitalism?</i>	115
<i>The Uncertain Victory</i>	116

Part III: Towards an Evolved Capitalism..... 118

Part III examines the tensions between Catholic social teaching and orthodox neoclassical economic theories with a view towards resolving the issues.

Chapter 9: The Social Teachings and Economics: Ideas in Tension 118

This chapter reprises the major themes from the social encyclicals and compares them to the corresponding ideas from neoclassical economics in order to highlight the tensions between them. It then establishes the criteria for an “ethical” economics that will allow us to judge the various solutions to the economic questions.

Some “Economic” Principles of Catholic Social Teaching.....	118
A “Catholic” Economics?	118
The Ultimate Purpose of the Economy.....	118
Human Work	119
Property	119
The Primacy of Labor.....	120
The Just Wage.....	120
Subsidiarity	120
Solidarity.....	121
Conflicts with Economic Theory.....	121
A “Neutral” Economy?.....	121
Work as a commodity.....	122
The Absolutism of Property	123
The Primacy of Capital.....	123
Commodity Pricing for Wages.....	124
“Limited Government”	125
Individualism	125
Criteria for an Ethical Economics	125
The Economic Problem.....	125
Solutions: Tradition, Command, and Market	126
Values: Normative and Positive Economics.....	127

Chapter 10: Towards an “Evolved” Capitalism..... 129

The neoclassical theory is “economistic” in that it reduces the human person to a utilitarian, egotistic, and interest-maximizing individual. The philosophical bases of this reductionism, especially as they appear in Ludwig von Mises’s Praxeology, are examined and found wanting, as are the economic conclusions that flow from it. We then attempt to reconstruct economic theory on the basis of Personalism by putting the human person and his social relationships at the heart of a proper economic theory. This implies that we replace self-interest with self-respect, put the worker ahead of

capital as the true source of growth, and recognize that all consumption is, in the last analysis, based on love--either the love of self alone, in dysfunctional economies, or the love of self and neighbor.

<i>Economism</i>	129
What's Love Got to Do with it?	129
Scarcity, or "Can there ever be enough to go around?"	132
The Economic Stork.....	133
The Distribution Function of Wages	134
The Utopia of Usurers	136
<i>Personalism</i>	137
Self-Interest vs. Self-Respect	137
The Source of Economic Growth: Persons	140
The Entrepreneurial Firm	141
The Mother's Problem, or "Ludwig, Listen to Your Mother!"	143
A Civilization of Love.....	144

Chapter 11: Marginal Productivity and the Just Wage 146

The conflict between social economics and neoclassicism becomes categorical in the question of marginal productivity. Either this formula does or does not "fairly" allocate all incomes; if it does, then there is simply no space for any additional ethical considerations; if it does not, then neoclassicism cannot be a complete economic theory. This chapter examines J. B. Clark's exposition of marginal productivity and notes its shortcomings. It then attempts to construct a theory of the just wage on natural law grounds, especially the law of property.

<i>The Capitalist Narrative</i>	146
Price and Externalities	146
<i>The Law of Rents</i>	148
<i>Marginal Productivity</i>	149
J. B. Clark and the Distribution of Incomes	150
Aristotle Overthrown	152
The Ethics of Marginal Productivity	152
<i>The Critique of Marginal Productivity</i>	154
The Reality Check	154
The Necessary Conditions.....	155
Empirical Verification	155
The Social Nature of Production	156
Two Factors or Three? Or One?	157
Marginal Productivity as Metaphor.....	158
The Definition of Capital.....	159
Summary: Equity and Equilibrium	160
<i>The Just Wage</i>	161
Natural Law and Property	161
Natural Property	161
Conventional Property	162
Subsistence.....	163
Measuring the Just Wage	165
Implementing the Just Wage	166

Chapter 12: The Neo-Conservative Response 170

The social teachings are not, by themselves, an economic system; they require a response by the laity to make them a concrete reality in the world. There are a variety of responses, but we will examine only two as representative of a larger collection of responses. The first response is that of neo-conservatism, which is examined through one of its founding documents, The Spirit of Democratic Capitalism by Michael Novak.

<i>Responses to Catholic Social Teaching</i>	170
<i>Weber's Question</i>	172
<i>The Spirit of Democratic Capitalism</i>	173
The Fact-Value Distinction	174
The Ideals of Democratic Capitalism	175
The Economic, Moral, and Political Orders	176
A Theology of Economics	177
<i>Evaluating Neo-Conservatism</i>	179
Capitalism and Natural Law.....	179
“Facts” without “Values”?.....	179
The “Orders” of Society	180
The Empty Altar and the New Religion.....	180
Man as Co-creator	182
Freedom, Formal and Material.....	183
A Pharisaically Good Conscience	185

Chapter 13: Distributivism 186

Distributivism deals with the problems of classical economics by adding the distributive principle which is missing from orthodox economic theory. The result is that equity in distribution, especially the distribution of productive property, is shown to be prior to equilibrium, and not the other way round as in neoclassical theory.

<i>The Triumph of Liberalism</i>	186
<i>The Chesterbelloc</i>	186
<i>The Servile State</i>	187
Stable Solutions.....	189
Socialism	190
<i>Up From Servility</i>	190
<i>The Economic Theory of Distributism</i>	193
<i>The Ownership Society</i>	195

Part IV: The Practice of Justice in the Modern Business World 198

Economic theory is worthless if it cannot be implemented by societies and businesses. Part IV examines real-world implementations of just economic theories such as the distribution of land and the means of production and the just wage. The success of these implementations makes the strongest possible case for economic thinking based in an understanding of distributive and corrective justice.

Chapter 14: Taiwan and the “Land to the Tiller” Program 198

Taiwan and the other “Asian Tigers” broke up the aristocratic monopoly on land and redistributed it to the farmers. The result was a flourishing--and internationally competitive--manufacturing economy.

<i>Land Monopoly and Labor Markets</i>	198
--	-----

<i>The “Land to the Tiller” Programs</i>	200
<i>Industrial Policy</i>	203
<i>Equality and Development</i>	205

Chapter 15: Development and Globalization 207

In contrast to Taiwan, the development of other “backward” economies has been less successful, indeed retrograde. Why, after pouring trillions of dollars into development and opening up “free” markets, have the results been so poor? The promise of globalization is that it would be a rising tide lifting all boats. But this has not happened. What went wrong? In a shrinking world, development must come to all, or all will be destabilized. The failures of the World Bank are compared with the successes of other approaches.

<i>The Growing Gap</i>	207
<i>The World Bank</i>	208
<i>The Values of Trade</i>	212
The Essential Goodness of Trade.....	212
Perversions of Trade	213
Fair Trade and Protectionism	215
<i>Cities and the Wealth of Nations</i>	217
Import Substitution.....	217
Transplants and Outsourcing	219
<i>Globalization and “Turbo-Capitalism”</i>	220

Chapter 16: Micro-Banking 225

What separates economic success from grinding poverty is the possession of capital, often just a few dollars’ worth of capital. The success of the Grameen Bank in providing small loans to impoverished people is examined. Grameen is, in many ways, the best illustration of the effectiveness of distributive justice, even in small amounts, in eradicating poverty.

<i>The \$27 Solution</i>	225
<i>The Grameen Bank</i>	226
<i>The Bicycle Bankers</i>	229
Capital: Social and Financial	230

Chapter 17: The Mondragón Cooperative Corporation 232

The objection remains that distributive justice is simply impractical in a world where manufacturing requires large-scale production and huge amounts of capital. The answer to this objection is given by the Mondragón Cooperative Corporation, an employee-owned conglomerate in Spain with sales of \$16 billion/annum and 77,000 worker-owners. The cooperatives offer an immense range of products and services, from the simplest to the most technologically sophisticated.

<i>Agency and Organization</i>	232
The Agency Dilemma.....	232
Organization.....	233
<i>The History of the MCC</i>	235
The Origins.....	235
The Support Cooperatives.....	236
The Recession of the 1980’s	238

<i>Organization</i>	239
The Basic Principles.....	239
Organizational Structure	240
<i>Workers as Owners</i>	241

Chapter 18: ESOP's and Profit Sharing..... 243

The chapter examines the successes and failures of Employee Stock Ownership plans as a means to attain the distributive justice necessary for a stable economy.

Chapter 19: The Just Wage in the Corporation 244

When ownership is not distributed widely in a firm, the problems of the just wage become a critical management problem. This chapter examines methods to make the firm more competitive using policies designed to lift the productivity of all employees to a level sufficient to support a just wage.

Chapter 20: The Vocation of Business 245

If we recognize the claims of justice in economics, and if we recognize the economic feasibility of just business practices, then we cannot deny the obligation of every businessperson to pursue justice in economics. This is not accomplished by renouncing sound business practices, but rather by embracing entrepreneurship as a way of life encompassing the social, political, economic, and moral aspects of man. It is, after all, not theory, but practice which makes justice alive in the world. Every businessperson, therefore, has a vocation to resolve, in his or her own practices, the tensions between economic behavior and moral behavior.

<i>The Unfreedom of the Free Market</i>	245
<i>Consumerism and Conversion</i>	
<i>The Vocation of Business</i>	

Bibliography

